

**Final Draft**

# **Quarter-3 Output Monitoring Report**

FY 2016-17

**City Governance Project**  
Local Government Engineering Department

## Table of Contents

<b>Abbreviation</b> .....	<b>i-iii</b>
<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>iv-vi</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>2. Process followed to carryout monitoring</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>3. Limitations of the monitoring</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>4. Monitoring Findings</b> .....	<b>2</b>
4.1 Component-1: <b>Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP)</b> .....	<b>2</b>
Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination.....	2
Area-2: Administrative Reform .....	6
Area 3: Tax Reform.....	12
Area 4: Financial Reform .....	15
Area 5: Citizen’s Awareness and Participation .....	19
Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement.....	26
Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement.....	30
4.2 Component-2: <b>Infrastructure Development</b> .....	<b>32</b>
<b>5. Challenges of the program</b> .....	<b>37</b>

### List of Tables

Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1).....	2
Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2) .....	3
Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established.....	4
Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation.....	5
Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3).....	6
Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established .....	6
Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.....	7
Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4) .....	8
Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised .....	9
Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity .....	9
Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU).....	10
Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees.....	11
Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published .....	12
Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment (T5) .....	12
Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased .....	13
Activity 3.3: Re-identification of source of tax.....	14
Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector (T6) .....	15
Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T7).....	15
Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems .....	16

Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year .....	16
Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year .....	16
Activity 4.6: All due debts to GOB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule .....	17
Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time .....	18
Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office.....	18
Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T8).....	19
Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T9).....	20
Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG) .....	21
Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared .....	22
Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum .....	22
Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter .....	24
Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC.....	24
Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional .....	25
Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan.....	26
Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T10), .....	26
Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP) .....	27
Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan.....	27
Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T11) .....	28
Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation .....	28
Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management (T12).....	29
Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law (T13) .....	30
Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established .....	31
Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented.....	32

## Abbreviations

APs	Affected Persons
ARC	Administrative Reform Committee
ARSP	Administrative Reform Strategic Plan
As req.	As require
B1	Batch One
B2	Batch Two
BDT	Bangladesh Taka
BME	Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation
CAP	Community Action Plan
CBO	Community Based Organization
CC	City Corporation
CCIDP	City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan
CDA	Chittagong Development Authority
CDC	Community Development Committee
CDCC	City Development Coordination Committee
CDU	Capacity Development Unit
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CG	Community Group
CGP	City Governance Project
ChCC	Chittagong City Corporation
CISC	City Information Service Center
CMIS	City Management Information System
CoCC	Comilla City Corporation
CPU	Comprehensive Planning Unit
Cr.	Course
CRC	Citizen Report Card
CSCC	Civil Society Coordination Committee
DAPs	Detail Area Plans
Dept.	Department
DMDP	Dhaka Metropolitan Development Plan
DoE	Department of Environment
E-governance	Electronic governance
E. ser.	Electronic Service

F&E	Financial and Establishment
Feas.	Feasible
FY	Financial Year
GAP	Gender Action Plan
GCC	Gazipur City Corporation
GICD	Governance Improvement and Capacity Development
GO	Government Organization
GOB	Government of Bangladesh
GRC	Grievance Redress Cell
ICGIAP	Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program
ID	Identification
IDPCC	Inclusive Development Plan of City Corporation
IFMS	Integrated Financial Management Software
IGAs	Income Generating Activities
ICT	Information Communication and Technology
IT	Information Technology
LEU	Law Enforcement Unit
LGD	Local Government Division
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
MCC	Mass Communication Cell
MIS	Management Information System
N/A	Not Applicable
NCC	Narayanganj City Corporation
NGO	Non-government Organization
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
PCO	Project Coordination Office
PIU	Project Implement Unit
PRAP	Poverty Reduction Action Plan
PRO	Public Relation Officer
PS	Private Secretary/ Personal Secretary
PSC	Project Steering Committee
Q2, Y3	Quarter Two, Year Three
Q3, Y3	Quarter Three, Year Three
3R	Reduce, Recycle & Reuse
RAJUK	Rajdhani Unnayan Kartipakkha

RpCC	Rangpur City Corporation
SAE	Sub-assistant Engineer
SC	Standing Committee
SMS	Sort Message Service
SW	Solid Waste
SWM	Solid Waste Management
SWMC	Solid Waste Management Committee
T1	Trigger one
T2	Trigger Two
ToR	Terms of Reference
TR	Test Relief
VGD	Vulnerable Group Development
VGF	Vulnerable Group Feeding
W	Ward
WASA	Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
WG	Working Group
WIT	Work Improvement Team
WLCC	Ward Level Coordination Committee
WM	Waste Management
WS	Water Supply

## Executive Summary

Governance Improvement & Capacity Development (GICD) and Urban Infrastructure Development are two major aspects of City Governance Project (CGP) implemented in Narayanganj, Comilla, Rangpur, Gazipur and Chittagong City Corporations to improve public services and promote economic opportunities by strengthening the City Governments' administrative capacity and improve urban infrastructure in the targeted City Corporations through implementation of Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP).

The project consists of four components, seven areas, forty-two activities followed by several hundred tasks of which 251 important tasks were considered for quarterly output monitoring in accordance with sets of performance criteria for each activity proposed in ICGIAP.

### Summary Findings of Governance Improvement and Capacity Development (GICD) Component

Produced outputs against a total of 251 main tasks under activities and areas are monitored till Q3, Y3, and compared by project City Corporations.

#### Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination

**Out of 8 tasks under activity 1**, RpCC attended 63% and rest four CC each attended 50% tasks; **out of 11 tasks under activity 2**, RpCC attended 73%, GCC & ChCC each 55%, NCC & CoCC each attended 45% tasks; **out of 7 tasks under activity 3**, NCC & ChCC each attended 71%, CoCC & GCC each 57% and RpCC attended 43% tasks; and **out of 8 tasks under activity 4**, NCC attended 78%, RpCC & GCC each 67%, and ChCC & CoCC each attended 0% tasks.

However, **out of total 34 monitored tasks under 4 activities of area 1**, RpCC attended 65%, NCC 62%, GCC 59%, ChCC 44% and CoCC attended 38% tasks.

#### Area-2: Administrative Reform

**Out of 5 tasks under activity 1**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 80% and CoCC attended 20% tasks; **out of 9 tasks under activity 2**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 33% and CoCC attended 11% tasks; **out of 6 tasks under activity 3**, NCC attended 67%, ChCC 50% and CoCC, RpCC & GCC each attended 33% tasks. **out of 6 tasks under activity 4**, ChCC attended 67%, RpCC & GCC each 50%, NCC & CoCC each attended 33% tasks; **out of 4 tasks under activity 5**, NCC, RpCC & ChCC each attended 50%, CoCC & GCC each attended 0% tasks; **out of 10 tasks under activity 6**, ChCC attended 67%, NCC, CoCC, RpCC & GCC each attended 33% tasks; **out of 9 tasks under activity 7**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 78%, CoCC attended 56% tasks; **out of 5 tasks under activity 8**, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 80% tasks; and **out of 3 tasks under activity 9**, each CC attended 100% tasks.

However, **out of total 57 monitored tasks under 9 activities of area 2**, ChCC attended 60%, NCC 54%, RpCC 53%, GCC 46% and CoCC attended 35% tasks.

#### Area-3: Tax Reform

**Out of 9 tasks under activity 1**, RpCC attended 100%, NCC, CoCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 89% tasks; **out of 6 tasks under activity 2**, RpCC attended 100%, NCC 67%, CoCC 17%, GCC 83% and ChCC attended 33% tasks; **out of 3 tasks under activity 3**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 67% and CoCC attended 0% tasks.

However, **out of total 18 monitored tasks under 3 activities of area 3**, RpCC attended 94%, GCC 83%, NCC 78%, ChCC 67% and CoCC attended 50% tasks.

#### Area-4: Financial Reform

**Out of 4 tasks under activity 1**, each CC attended 50% tasks; **out of 2 tasks under activity 2**, each CC attended 100% tasks; **out of 2 tasks under activity 3**, each CC attended 0% tasks because Integrated Financial Management Software (IFMS) is not available yet; **out of 4 tasks under activity 4**, NCC attended 67%, RpCC & ChCC each attended 75%, CoCC & GCC each attended 25% tasks; and **out of 4 tasks under activity 5**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 100% and CoCC attended 0% tasks; **out of 3 tasks under activity 6**, GCC attended 100%, NCC, CoCC & ChCC each attended 67% and RpCC attended 0% tasks; **out of 5 tasks under**

**activity 7**, NCC, CoCC, RpCC & GCC each attended 100% and ChCC attended 0% tasks; **out of 3 tasks under activity 8**, each CC attended 100% tasks.

However, **out of total 27 monitored tasks under 8 activities of area 4**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC attended 74%, CoCC attended 56% tasks.

#### **Area-5: Citizen's Awareness and Participation**

**Out of 11 tasks under activity 1**, RpCC & GCC each attended 55%, NCC 36%, ChCC 45% and CoCC attended 9% tasks; **out of 7 tasks under activity 2**, NCC, RpCC & GCC each attended 43%, ChCC 57% and CoCC attended 0% tasks; **out of 7 tasks under activity 3**, NCC, CoCC & ChCC each attended 28%, and RpCC & GCC each attended 14% tasks; **out of six tasks under activity 4**, RpCC & GCC each attended 50%, CoCC 33%, NCC & ChCC each attended 17% tasks; **out of 17 tasks under activity 5**, GCC attended 76% and rest CCs each attended 65% tasks; **out of 4 tasks under activity 6**, each project CC attended 100% tasks; **out of 5 tasks under activity 7**, each project CC attended 60% tasks; and **out of 6 tasks under activity 8**, each project CC attended 25% tasks.

However, **out of total 63 monitored tasks under 8 activities of area 5**, GCC attended 54%, RpCC 51%, ChCC 49%, NCC 46% and CoCC attended 38% tasks.

#### **Area-6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement**

**Out of 5 tasks under activity 1**, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 40% and CoCC attended 20% tasks; **out of 4 tasks under activity 2**, each project CC attended 50% tasks; **out of 4 tasks under activity 3**, each project CC attended 75% tasks; **out of 2 tasks under activity 4**, each project CC attended 50% tasks; **out of 4 tasks under activity 5**, NCC & RpCC each attended 100%, and CoCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 50% tasks; **out of 7 tasks under activity 6**, each project CC attended 29% tasks; and **out of 10 tasks under activity 7**, each project CC attended 50% tasks.

However, **out of total 36 monitored tasks under 7 activities of area 6**, NCC and RpCC attended 50%, GCC and ChCC 44% and CoCC attended 42% tasks.

#### **Area-7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement**

**Out of 5 tasks under activity 1**, NCC & ChCC each attended 100%, and CoCC, RpCC & GCC each attended 80% tasks; **out of 8 tasks under activity 2**, RpCC attended 50%, and NCC, GCC & ChCC each attended 38%, and CoCC attended 20% tasks; **out of 3 tasks under activity 3**, each project CC attended 33% tasks.

However, **out of total 16 monitored tasks under 3 activities of area 7**, NCC, RpCC and ChCC attended 56%, GCC 50% and CoCC attended 38% tasks.

In summary, **out of total 251 monitored tasks under 42 activities of 7 areas**, RpCC attended 59%, NCC 57%, GCC 55%, ChCC 55% and CoCC attended 41% tasks. *NCC & CoCC could not attend few activities during Q3, Y3 because of CC election.*

#### **Summary Findings of Infrastructure Development Component**

The urban component planned to construct/install 419.99 km road; 2903 m bridge/overpass; 196.47 km drain & retaining wall as protective work; 11650 nos. Street light; 6 nos. water supply system; 2 nos. bus/truck terminal; and 8 nos. school cum cyclone shelter in project CCs. Among them BME monitored the physical and financial progress of Batch-1 and Batch-2 sub-project's (civil works) during Q3, Y3.

##### **Batch-1**

**NCC, out of total 3 sub-projects**, two sub-projects (Package 2 & 3) completed 100% physical work followed by 88% payment progress; and remaining one sub-project (Package-1) completed 93% physical work followed by 85% payment progress. *Note that package-1 required three and package-2&3 required two-time extension.*

**CoCC, out of total (9-1) 8 sub-projects**, completed 100% physical work of all 8 sub-projects followed 100% payment progress of one (Package-09) and for remaining 7 sub-projects payment progress between 76%-84%. *Note that two sub-projects (Package 5 & 6) required time extension once.*

**RpCC, out of total 18 sub-projects**, four sub-projects (Package 1, 3, 5 & 17) completed 100% physical work followed by 100%, 98%, 94% and 85% payment progress; seven sub-projects (Package 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 14 & 18)



physical progress between 90%-98% followed by payment progress between 68-90%; four sub-projects physical progress between 80-87% followed by payment progress between 68-90% and remaining three sub-projects physical progress between 58-75% followed by payment progress between 51-63%. *Note that two sub-projects (Package 6 & 11) required time extension twice.*

**GCC, out of total 9 sub-projects**, two sub-projects (Package 6 & 9) completed 97 & 91% physical works followed by 80 & 84% payment progress; one sub-project (Package 7) completed 80% physical progress followed by 69% payment progress; three sub-projects (Package 2, 4 & 8) completed between 57-76% physical progress followed by between 22-55% payment progress; and remaining three sub-projects (Package 1, 3, & 5) completed between 37-45% physical progress followed by between 22-30% payment progress. *Note that five sub-projects required once and four sub-projects (Package 1, 3, 7 & 9) required twice time extension.*

**ChCC, out of total (18-2) 16 sub-projects**, three sub-projects (Package 1, 2 & 4) completed 100% physical progress followed by 46%, 60%, and 80% payment progress; four sub-projects (Package 3, 11, 12 & 13) completed 95% physical progress followed by between 79-85% payment progress; seven sub-projects (Package 6, 8, 9, 10, 15, 17 & 18) completed between 50-80% physical progress followed by between 42- 71% payment progress and remaining two sub-projects (Package 7 & 16) completed less than 25% physical progress followed by 0 and 5% payment progress. *Note that except package 4 & 15 all sub-projects (14) required time extension.*

#### **Batch-2**

**NCC, out of total 12 sub-projects**, three sub-projects (Package 4, 5 & 6) just started construction work followed 5, 0.5 & 1.25% physical progress and for rest 9 sub-projects tender under process.

**CoCC**, yet to get clearance for batch-2 sub-projects.

**RpCC, out of total 25 sub-projects**, six sub-projects (Package 3, 5, 7, 8, 9 & 23) tender approved; seven sub-projects (Package 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 & 20) NOAs issued and remaining three sub-projects (Package 6, 10 & 21) tender evaluation under process.

**GCC, out of total 14 sub-projects**, five sub-projects (Package 4, 7, 9, 11 & 13) contract agreement signed; five sub-projects under tender evaluation process and rest four sub-projects under design/estimate.

**ChCC, out of 17 sub-projects**, three sub-projects (Package 10, 14 and 17) received tenders.

## **1. Introduction**

Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation (BME) consultant team on behalf of Project Coordination Office (PCO) carried out this output monitoring produced through ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities till quarter-3 of the project year-3.

The objectives of monitoring were to-

- Support PCO and PIU to assess regular progress
- Facilitate proper implementation of the project interventions
- Extract lessons learned in the form of providing feedback for possible improvements, and
- Assess consistency of the progress according to plans and targets.

## **2. Process followed to carryout monitoring**

The consultant teams followed most collaborative, interactive, consultative, feedback sharing, and participatory processes to carry out output monitoring for quarter-3 of the project year-3. Broadly following steps were followed to carry out this assignment:

1. Defined boundary in terms of components, areas, activities, tasks, targets and timeline up to Q3 project Y3
2. Review and updated tool for field data collection
3. Conducted introductory meeting with each City Corporation officials and authorities
4. Collected information from concerned city corporation officials and verified at real situations
5. Shared initial findings with concerned city corporation officials and authorities to validate collected information and receive feedbacks for further development, and
6. Shared summery findings with project authorities, GICD personnel and LGED high officials.

## **3. Limitations of the monitoring**

Among others, the monitoring team largely faced following limitations:

- This Q3, Y3 output monitoring was confined to ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities implemented at city corporation levels
- Absence of annual implementation plans and inadequate progress reports
- Limited physical verification of outputs produced till Q3, Y3
- Frequent turnover of focal persons at CC levels
- City Council election at Narayanganj & Comilla
- Different ICGIAP document introduced at field level, and
- Inadequate documentary evidences in support of produced outputs.

## 4. Monitoring Findings

### 4.1 Component-1: Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP)

#### Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination

##### Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
1.1.1 Assigned officer/ staff in charge for e-governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff <sup>1</sup>	1 Cr./CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (As part of IT training)	1 Cr./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.4 Arranged component wise training <sup>2</sup>	9 Cr./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
1.1.6 Established e-services <sup>3</sup> with SMS system	e-ser/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.1.7 Prepared long-term plan for e-governance	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, citizen charter, trade license etc.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not applicable, Cr= Course

##### Analysis:

**1.1.1 Assigned officer/staff in-charge for e-governance**, all CCs (5) assigned officer/staff in-charge for e-governance before Q2, Y3.

**1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff**, all CCs (5) provided two types of trainings "Basic Computer" & "E-governance" to concern CC's staff before Q2, Y3. *The dates of basic Computer training at RpCC and GCC are 23-28.05.2015 & 7-12.06.2015 which were missed in Q2, Y3 report.*

**1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (as part of training)**, *none of the CC (5) arranged exchange visit as an integral part of "E-governance" training till Q3, Y3.*

**1.1.4 Arranged component wise training**, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC provided training only on "Basic Computer" (ref.1.1.2), *no component (8) wise training was organized till Q3Y3.*

**1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software**, only RpCC introduced MIS software in July 2015 has turned into web base CMIS software in January 2017. *None of the rest 4 CCs developed and installed web based software for MIS till Q3, Y3.*

**1.1.6 Established e-services with SMS system**, RpCC has introduced dynamic web base software titled CMIS and linked with SMS system on 17.01.2017. *Rest CCs (4) only have introduced SMS system before Q2, Y3 not linked with any kind of e-services till Q3, Y3.*

**1.1.7 Prepared long-term plan for e-governance**, *none of the CC prepared long term plan for e-governance till Q3, Y3.*

**1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, Citizen Charter, Trade License etc.** RpCC introduced dynamic web portal for birth & death registration, e-tendering, trade license, citizen charter etc. and uploaded on website during Q3, Y3. *Rest CCs (4) somehow computerized above-mentioned items not added with dynamic web portal. Citizen Charter of CoCC and GCC are not uploading on their website.*

<sup>1</sup> Staff who are involved in operation of e-governance system

<sup>2</sup> Trainings are on basic computer, tax assessment software, tax collection section, water billing software, trade license software, market management software, birth & death registration, and orientation, non-motorized vehicle management software, town information service center

<sup>3</sup> As mentioned in the long-term plan of City Corporation, including digitizing certificates and licenses

## Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
1.2.1 Established MCC <sup>4</sup> with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget	3/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
1.2.3 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CCCC for review	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.2.4 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CC for approval	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.2.5 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor	5/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.6 Registered disseminated SMS to at least 7500 citizens by Year 3	7500/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.7 Disseminated message/materials/updates annually to public through different medias including SMS <sup>5</sup>	6/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.8 Held MCC meeting <sup>6</sup>	11 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.9 Prepared/ introduced SMS record keeping system	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.10 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.2.11 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not applicable, Cr= Course

### Analysis:

**1.2.1 Established MCC with specific ToR**, all MCCs (5) are established in each CC before Q2, Y3. *CoCC did not follow composition as recommended in ToR. (SAE selected as Member Secretary instead of PRO, 2 members selected from tax dept.)*

Mr. Rashedul Islam, PS to Mayor, RpCC has given responsibility of MCC Chairperson, since transfer of Mr. Fazlul Kabir, the Secretary RpCC.

**1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget**, MCC at RpCC has prepared plans and budget before Q2, Y3 but not included in CC budget, *while rest CCs (4) did not have such initiative till Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.3 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CCCC for review**, *none of the MCC (5) submitted their annual plans & budget to respective CCCC for review till Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.4 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CC for approval**, *none of the MCC (5) submitted their annual plans & budget to respective CC for approval till Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.5 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor**, MCC at RpCC, GCC & ChCC received approval of selected messages and materials for campaign from their respective Mayor on 16.03.2017, 19.01.2017 & 30.1.2017, *NCC and CoCC did not have such initiative during Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.6 Registered and disseminated SMS to 7500 citizens by Year- 3**, all CCs (5) registered 7500 citizens for dissemination of specific and special information through SMS up Q3, Y3. *None of the CC has schedule for information dissemination.*

<sup>4</sup> Comprises of Secretary, Public Relation Officer, Head of IT section, Officer of each department selected by department head

<sup>5</sup> **Specific** items are large scale infrastructure work that affect citizen's life, cultural program, political gathering etc. and **special** items are regular meeting of CCCC, WLCC, City Council, CDCC, and mass public meeting; free vaccination, new services started in CC office, special meetings, and ICGIAP activities, like campaign for law enforcement, disaster alert, large scale infrastructure work and traffic control etc.

<sup>6</sup> Quarterly

**1.2.7 Disseminated message/materials/updates to public through different media including SMS**, all CCs (5) generally uses local newspapers, publicity boards, leaflets, posters, stickers, miking, cable network, website and rally to disseminate public information in regards to seasonal greetings, regular municipal tax payment, health and education, law enforcement, waste deposit to particular place etc. *In regards to select messages, CCs need to pay attention to specific and special items.*

**1.2.8 Held MCC meeting**, out of targeted 11, NCC held 6 MCC quarterly meetings, CoCC held 4, RpCC held 6, GCC 4 and ChCC held 6 quarterly MCC meetings. During Q3, Y3 MCC quarterly meeting held at NCC on ---/---/---, CoCC on 23.3.2017, RpCC on 16.3.2017, GCC on 6.3.2017 and at ChCC held quarterly MCC meeting on 28.3.2017, Y3, *but NCC could not show up with records. None of the MCC could meet target till Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.9 Prepared/introduced SMS record keeping system**, all CCs (5) have introduced and maintained both digital and manual SMS record keeping system till Q3, Y3.

**1.2.10 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination**, *none of the MCC (5) conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination till Q3, Y3.*

**1.2.11 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report**, *none of the MCC (5) prepared Annual Report for CC till Q3, Y3.*

### Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
1.3.1 Established CISC <sup>7</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics	As req./CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.3.4 Trained <sup>8</sup> relevant officials on e-governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
1.3.5 Provided service <sup>9</sup> of CISC	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes
1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.3.7 CISC prepared annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not Applicable*

#### Analysis:

**1.3.1 Established CISC**, all CCs (5) established CISC before Q2, Y3, *but RpCC could not allocate appropriate space for CISC at CC building, because they are running CC office at old municipal building and do not have enough space till completion of new office building. The RpCC management realized the situation and agreed to allocate required space for CISC soon after construction of new building.*

**1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge**, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, and GCC assigned officer/staff in-charge before Q2, Y3 and ChCC assigned in Q3, Y3 for CISC operation.

**1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics**, PCO supplied chairs, tables, file cabinets, computers, printers and photocopiers to each CC for CISC use before Q2, Y3. *All CCs need to ensure use of those furniture and logistics at CISC outlet.*

<sup>7</sup> An electronic based ICT facilitated one-stop service center at each City Corporation to provide basic services for citizens, such as issue certificates, licenses, uphold citizens' rights etc.

<sup>8</sup> CC officials & staffs who are involved in CISC operation and Communication Standing Committee members on e-governance orientation meeting, ICT basic skills and ongoing e-governance activities

<sup>9</sup> **CC Services-** tax assessment, tax collection, water supply and collection, trade license issue & renewal, non-motorized vehicle license issue & renewal, birth & death registration, tender, building plan permission, road cutting, drain cutting, market & hat lease, street light, waste management, dog control, mosquito control, city cclean, and virus influence. **Government Services-**public examination results, online university admission, government forms, birth & death registration, citizenship certificate, VGD/VGF list, government circulars and notices, agriculture and health consultancy, govt. life insurance, services of CC office, development (VGD, VGF, TR, minority welfare, sports & cultural activities, development of educational institutions), revenue (tax assessment, trade license, building plan permission, land acquisition money, requisition, certificate suit, hat & bazaar, vested property, exchange property, stamp vendor license, land survey), license (C.I sheet, cement, poison, food grain), complain & remedy (pension, land, family affairs, law & orders), relief & rehabilitation (donation, grant, GR), certification (marriage, NGO) and miscellaneous (different committee approval, different appointments, dramatically performance, expatriate welfare, examination matters)

**1.3.4 Trained relevant officials on e-governance**, NCC, CoCC and ChCC trained one officer each on 'Basic Computer' before Q2, Y3. *But, RpCC and GCC did not provide such training to any staff till Q3, Y3. All CCs need to provide training to CC officer & staff members involved in CISC operation and members of the Standing Committee for Communication, on subjects, such as orientation meeting on e-governance, basic training on ICT skills, basic training on e-governance & ongoing e-governance activities.*

**1.3.5 Provided service of CISC**, all CCs (5) are providing information on a few CC services to their citizens (such as issuing certificates & licenses, health services, engineering services, administrative services, education services, Tax/Fees/Rates) from reception desk till Q3, Y3. *CCs need to turn reception desk into CISC and cover information on government services.*

**1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan**, *none of the CISC (5) have operation plan.*

**1.3.7 CISC prepared annual progress report**, *none of the CISC (5) official prepared annual progress report till Q3, Y3.*

**Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No
1.4.2 Examined selected issues by Communication Standing Committee	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
1.4.3 Approved selected issues by CSCC & CC meeting	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
1.4.4 Declared <sup>10</sup> date for Mass Public Meeting by MCC	5/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No
1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No
1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting <sup>11</sup>	5/ CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting	5/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting**, MCCs at NCC, and RpCC, have selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues for Q2, Y3 and GCC for Q3, Y3.

**1.4.2 Examined selected issues by Communication Standing Committee**, MCC at RpCC presented selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues to Standing Committee for Communication for examination during Q3, Y3, *while MCC at GCC bypassed examining selected mass public meeting issues by Standing Committee for Communication.*

**1.4.3 Approved selected issues by CSCC & in CC meeting**, MCC at RpCC and GCC obtained approval of selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues from CSCC and CC meeting during Q3, Y3.

**1.4.4 Declared date for Mass Public Meeting through different media by MCC**, MCC at GCC declared one mass public meeting (date, place, time, discussion issues etc.) through notice board, local TV cable network, SMS delivery and announcing through microphone to inspire and maximize people participation and raise their voice in meeting during Q3, Y3.

**1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before**, *MCC at GCC informed one mass public meeting (date, place, time, and discussion issues) to the citizens in a limited scale and a few days ago instead of a month during Q3, Y3.*

<sup>10</sup> Declared date for public meeting through notice board, SMS delivery, radio, TV, social media, website, announcement, microphone, poster and banner hanging in significant places etc.

<sup>11</sup> At least twice a year

**1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting**, one mass public meeting held only at GCC during Q3, Y3, *CoCC did not at all organize any mass public meeting since inception.*

**1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting**, *MCC at GCC did not prepared report on Mass Public meeting held during Q3, Y3.*

**1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting**, *none of the MCC (5) prepared next year plans and specific budget for mass public meeting till Q3, Y3.*

## Area-2: Administrative Reform

### Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.1.1 Established CDCC <sup>12</sup> with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.1.3 Organized workshop annually	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting	11 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members	11 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

*N/A= Not Applicable*

#### Analysis:

**2.1.1 Established CDCC with specific ToR**, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CDCCs in accordance with the specific ToR before Q2, Y3, while NCC re-establish CDCC after sitting new elected City Council during Q3, Y3 and *CoCC has to re-establish CDCC after sitting new City Council.*

**2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge**, all CCs (5) assigned either CEO or Secretary as officer in-charge for CDCC to perform secretarial work before Q3, Y3.

**2.1.3 Organized workshop**, *none of the CC (5) organized workshop either on CDCC operation guideline and annual general workshop till Q3, Y3.*

**2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting**, out of targeted 11 CDCC quarterly meetings, NCC held 6 meetings, CoCC held 6, RpCC held 7, GCC 7 and ChCC held 6 meetings till Q3, Y3, of them except CoCC all other CCs (4) held one CDCC meeting during Q3, Y3. *Note that CoCC could not organize CDCC meeting in Q3, Y3 due to absence of City Council for election.*

**2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members**, *reported that CDCC meeting minutes are being distributed among the members, wherever meeting held in Q3, Y3.*

### Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee <sup>13</sup> (ARC)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.2 Organized workshop <sup>14</sup> on ARC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.3 Conducted regular quarterly ARC meeting	11 /CC	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.2.4 Produced ARC strategic plan for each department	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>12</sup> Comprises of Mayor, head of Standing Committees, CEO, representative of Private Sector and representatives of National agencies

<sup>13</sup> Comprises of Mayor, CEO, Secretary, and head of departments

<sup>14</sup> Orientation workshop for ARC members according contents described in guideline

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CSCC	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.7 Promote implementation of strategic plan of each department	1/Dpt./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.8 Quarterly monitoring of ARC strategic plan implementation	1/Dpt./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.9 ARC produced final report annually	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable, Dpt.= Department

### Analysis:

**2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee (ARC),** all CCs (5) established ARCs before Q2, Y3.

**2.2.2 Organized workshop on ARC,** *except CoCC, rest CCs (4) organized a day long workshop on "ARC Operation Guideline" for ARC member's before Q2, Y3.*

**2.2.3 Conducted regular quarterly ARC meeting,** out of targeted 11 ARC quarterly meetings, *NCC held 6 meetings, CoCC held 1, RpCC held 2, GCC held 3 and ChCC held 5 ARC quarterly meetings till Q3, Y3. Note that all CCs (5) held one ARC meeting during Q3, Y3.*

**2.2.4 Produced ARC strategic plan for each department,** *none of the ARC (5) produced administrative reform strategic plan for each department till Q3Y3.*

**2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CSCC,** *none of the CSCC (5) reviewed ARC strategic plan of each department. Since ARC strategic plans are not produce till Q3 Y3.*

**2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting,** *none of the City Council (5) approved ARSP of each department in their meetings. Since ARC strategic plans are not produced till Q3, Y3.*

**2.2.7 Promote implementation of strategic plan of each department,** *none of the ARC (5) promoted implementation of administrative reform Strategic Plan of each department. Since Strategic Plans are not prepared till Q3, Y3.*

**2.2.8 Quarterly monitor ARC strategic plan implementation,** *none of the ARC (5) monitored progress of administrative reform Strategic Plan implementation of each department. Since Strategic Plan for each department is not produced till Q3, Y3.*

**2.2.9 ARC produced final report annually,** *none of the ARC (5) produced annual report till Q3, Y3.*

### Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.3.1 Assigned officers in-charge from each dept.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.3.2 Organized workshop <sup>15</sup> for preparing vision and mission	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural)	As req/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting	As req/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	N/A
2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission	As req.	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>15</sup> Workshop participants (32) are assigned officer, 25 officials/staffs from relevant departments, 5 CGP staffs, and 2 support staff from relevant departments



Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.3.6 Reviewed vision and mission	As req.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**2.3.1 Assigned officers in charge from each department,** reported that all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge from each department to prepare own department's vision & mission before Q3, Y3, *but no documentary evidence found.*

**2.3.2 Organized workshop for preparing vision and mission,** all CCs (5) organized workshop on "preparation of vision and mission" for assigned officer in-charge and relevant staff members of each department before Q2, Y3, *but no workshop report produced till Q3, Y3.*

**2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural),** *none of the department of CC's have presented their draft visions and missions for FY 2015-16 to Standing Committee for Sports and Culture for review prior to obtain approval from City Council meeting till Q3, Y3.*

**2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting,** bypassing Standing Committee for Sports and Culture NCC, GCC and ChCC council meetings approved mission and vision of City Corporation as well as of each department before Q2, Y3. *RpCC and CoCC council meetings did not approve such missions and visions till Q3, Y3.*

**2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission,** NCC displayed visions and missions in their website as well as reflected in Citizen Charter before Q2, Y3. *Rest CCs (4) did not display vision and mission till Q3, Y3.*

**2.3.6 Reviewed vision and mission,** NCC, GCC and ChCC did not go for annual review of visions and missions, because those did not cross one year time from date of approval till Q3, Y3.

#### Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.4.1 Established CDU <sup>16</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.2 Formulated training program <sup>17</sup> (manual, plans, and budget etc.)	As req.	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider <sup>18</sup>	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.4.4 Facilitated/ proposed kaizen and skill training	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.5 CDU Monitor implementation of Kaizen activities and technical training	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
2.4.6 Prepared quarterly progress and annual report on capacity development activities	11/CC & 2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**2.4.1 Established CDU,** all CDUs (5) are established before Q2, Y3.

**2.4.2 Formulated training program (manual, plans, budget etc.),** CDUs (3) at RpCC, GCC and ChCC have prepared yearly training schedule for FY 2016-17. *None of the CDU (5) prepared training program including manual, plans, budget etc. till Q3, Y3.*

<sup>16</sup> Comprises of CEO, Secretary and heads of all departments

<sup>17</sup> Training program formulation steps are 1) review of ARP, 2) proposal for training, installation of equipment and Increase of manpower, 3) selection and formulation of Capacity Development Program, and 4) Kaizen Training

<sup>18</sup> Potential training Providers are: **GOB-** NILG, LGED, UMU, DPHE, BARD, RDA, DoSW, CCs, DoE; **Academic Institutions-** IoGS, BRAC University, BUET/ CUET/Other universities and **NGOs/International Organizations-** IUCN Bangladesh; IEB, BIM, BIAM

**2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider, *none of CDU (5) selected training service provider till Q3, Y3.***

**2.4.4 Facilitated/proposed Kaizen and skill training, all CCs (5) facilitated Kaizen and Skill training for CDU members together with staff from each department (ref. 2.6.4) before Q3, Y3.**

**2.4.5 CDU Monitor implementation of Kaizen activities and technical training, *none of the CDU (5) monitored implementation of Kaizen activities till Q3, Y3. Only departmental heads at ChCC monitored implementation of Kaizen activities of their own department in Q3Y3.***

**2.4.6 Prepared Quarterly and Annual progress report on capacity development activities, *none of CDU (5) prepared quarterly and annual progress reports till Q3, Y3.***

#### Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff	All staff/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC	All staff /CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff	All staff /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.5.4 Job descriptions reviewed by CDU	As req.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*N/A= Not Applicable*

#### Analysis:

**2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff, NCC, RpCC and ChCC prepared job descriptions for all staff before Q2, Y3, *but CoCC and GCC didn't prepare staff job description till Q3, Y3.***

**2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC, NCC, RpCC and ChCC have approved revised Job Descriptions of all staff in their City Council meetings and subsequently submitted to the Ministry for concurrence before Q2, Y3. *CoCC and GCC did not approve all staff job description till Q3, Y3.***

**2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff, *none of the CC (5) circulated revise job descriptions to all staff with official letter from Mayor, because they have not yet received concurrence on revised job descriptions from Ministry.***

**2.5.4 Job descriptions reviewed by CDU: task of Y4.**

#### Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.6.1 Selected focal person <sup>19</sup> by CDU	1/Dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.6.2 Formed work improvement team <sup>20</sup> (WIT)	1/Dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT	1/Dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen	1/Dept./CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.8 Final report submitted to Mayor, and best practice prize given to one department	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>19</sup> Member of CDU are namely head of departments

<sup>20</sup> Comprises of 3-5 members from each department and chaired by head of the department

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.6.9 CDU conducted monitoring on progress report and field visit	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.10 Published Kaizen activity progress on website	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**2.6.1 Selected focal person by CDU**, except at ChCC, *none of the CDU (4) selected focal person among members to perform Kaizen activity till Q3, Y3.*

**2.6.2 Formed work improvement team (WIT)**, *none of the department at five CCs formed Work Improvement Team (WIT) to perform Kaizen activity till Q3, Y3.*

**2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT**, *none developed Annual Action Plan for Kaizen activity. Since, WITs are not formed till Q3Y3.*

**2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen**, a daylong training on “Kaizen activity” for department/section heads of all CCs (5) was conducted before Q2, Y3.

**2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department**, all CCs (5) introduced one Kaizen activity in each department in project year2. Moreover, ChCC added new 8 Kaizen activities in each (8) departments during Q3, Y3.

**2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity**, *none of the CC (5) made budget allocation for Kaizen activity till Q3, Y3.*

**2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU**, *none of the CDU (5) compiled their Annual report for CC till Q3, Y3.*

**2.6.8 Final report submitted to Mayor, and best practice prize given to one department**, *none of the CDU (5) submitted final report to the Mayor and gave prize to the best practice department.*

**2.6.9 CDU conducted monitoring on progress report and field visit**, *none of the CDU (5) monitored Kaizen activities based on progress report and field visit during Q3, Y3.*

**2.6.10 Published Kaizen activity progress on website**, *none of the CDU (5) produced and published Kaizen activity progress report on their website till Q3, Y3.*

#### Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.7.1 Established CPU <sup>21</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.2 Established task force <sup>22</sup> for infrastructure	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.3 Established task force <sup>23</sup> for governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long-term plan	3/CC 1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting	33/CC	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and	33/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>21</sup> Comprises of head engineering department, town planner and head of relevant departments

<sup>22</sup> Comprises of 16 officials from relevant departments, 1 facilitator, and 2 officials

<sup>23</sup> Comprises of 16 officials from relevant departments, 1 facilitator, and 2 officials

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
Development Standing Committee											
2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.7.9 Prepared Annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**2.7.1 Established CPU**, all CCs (5) established CPU before Q2, Y3. *NCC needs to include representative from all departments, not only Urban Planner, Medical Officer, and Chief Accounts Officer as it is now.*

**2.7.2 Established task force for infrastructure**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Task Force for Infrastructure before Q2, Y3. *CoCC did not establish Task Force for Infrastructure till Q3, Y3.*

**2.7.3 Established task force for governance**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Task Force for Governance before Q2, Y3. *CoCC did not establish Task Force for governance till Q3, Y3.*

**2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long-term plan**, all CPUs (5) prepared draft short and long-term plan for infrastructure development before Q2, Y3. *However, did not follow outline described in the project document.*

**2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline**, all CPUs (5) use to prepare IDP rolling plan each year till FY 2016-17 before Q2, Y3. *However, did not follow outline described in the project document.*

**2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting**, out of targeted 33 CPU monthly meetings for each. NCC conducted 10 meetings, CoCC 7, RpCC 6, GCC 12 and ChCC conducted 4 CPU monthly meetings till Q3, Y3. *CoCC and RpCC each conducted one monthly meeting during Q3, Y3, instead of 3 meetings.*

**2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee**, *none of the CPU (5) held meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee till Q3, Y3.*

**2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting**, all CPUs (5) at City Corporation level used to present their progress in Council meeting, *but discussion and decision points of CPU activities are not adequately reflected in council meeting minutes till Q3, Y3.*

**2.7.9 Prepared Annual report**, *none of the CPU (5) prepared their Annual Progress report till Q3, Y3.*

#### Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees <sup>24</sup>	1/each SC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council	1/each SC	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence	33/SC/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings	33/SC/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by standing committees	2/SC/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

<sup>24</sup> One high/responsible officer in each CC

**Analysis:**

**2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge to established Standing Committee before Q3, Y3.

**2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council**, all City Councils (5) approved ToR for their established Standing Committees before Q2, Y3. *Note that NCC has to revise Standing Committees ToR, because they reduced standing committees into 18 from 20 on 8.2.2017.*

**2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence**, all CCs (5) sent proposed Standing Committee ToRs to ministry for concurrence before Q2, Y3. *NCC shall have to send once again propose ToR of their re-organized Standing Committees to ministry for concurrence.*

**2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings**, *Standing Committee meetings are held need based, not monthly in accordance with CC Act 2009.*

*Note that all (18) Standing Committee monthly meetings were held at ChCC in February and March 2017.*

**2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by Standing Committees**, *none of Standing Committee prepared their Annual Progress report till Q3, Y3.*

**Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report**, all CCs (5) prepared draft Annual Administrative reports for last two FYs.

**2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting**, all City Councils (5) approved Annual Administrative reports in their meetings for last two FYs.

**2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published**, all City Corporations (5) published their Annual Administrative reports for last two FYs.

**Area 3: Tax Reform**

**Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor	1/CC	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.2 Deployed tax assessors and collectors one/1000 holdings	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
3.1.7 Created link system between “holding tax ID number” and construction registration	As req.	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
3.1.8 Increased Tax collection	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report	11/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor:** all CCs (5) employed and/or deployed senior Tax Assessor.

**3.1.2 Deployed Tax Assessors and Collectors, one/1000 holdings,** NCC deployed a total of 41 staff (tax assessors/collectors) in tax section, CoCC -----, RpCC 33, GCC 25 and ChCC deployed a total of 127 staff in tax section before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO,** all CCs (5) introduced PCO supplied tax assessment manual/guideline before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff),** deployed tax section staff of all CCs (5) received three days long skill up training on “Financial Management Software” from PCO before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval,** NCC, CoCC and ChCC continuing tax re- assessment since in Q1, Y3. The tax re assessment for RpCC and GCC are not due yet.

**3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database,** NCC, CoCC and ChCC introduced computerized system for tax assessment database. Rest of two CCs (RpCC & GCC) introduced MSU software for tax assessment database in 2016. *None of the CC uses IFMS software, because the software not ready yet.*

**3.1.7 Created link system between holding tax ID number and construction registration,** RpCC and CoCC created link system between holding tax ID number and construction registration in Q2 and Q3, Y3 respectively. *NCC, GCC and ChCC, needs to find ways because two different authorities RAJUK/CDA and City Corporations are involved in this regard.*

**3.1.8 Increased Tax collection,** apparently tax collection amount has been increased in all CCs (5), *but not up to the expected level or target.*

**3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report,** all CCs (5) used to prepare tax collection quarterly progress report, *but CoCC did not prepare report in Q3, Y3 because of tax re-assessment work.*

#### Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.2.2 Prepared quarterly progress report and present it City Corporation meeting	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.3 Review progress of interim assessment linking with Finance and Establishment Standing Committee and place the report to CC monthly meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO	11/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection efficiency up to 85%	1/CC	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
3.2.6 Increased tax collection efficiency	As req./CC	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration, Except NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC** identified and included missing holdings on to the tax register book quarterly till Q3, Y3. *CoCC did not identify and include missing holdings in to their tax register.*

**3.2.2 Prepared quarterly progress report and present it City Corporation meeting,** RpCC and GCC prepared quarterly progress report on interim tax assessment and presented to CC meeting regularly till Q3, Y3. *NCC, CoCC and ChCC also use to prepare progress report on interim tax assessment and present to CC meeting as and when required.*

**3.2.3 Review progress of interim assessment,** NCC, RpCC and GCC reviewed progress of interim tax assessment linking with Finance and Establishment Standing Committee and presented to City Council meetings till Q3, Y3. *CoCC and ChCC did not review progress of interim tax assessment linking with Finance and Establishment Standing Committee, since start of 5 years interval tax assessment.*

**3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO,** RpCC and GCC submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO till Q3, Y3, *but NCC, CoCC and ChCC did not submit such report to PCO.*

**3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection,** NCC and RpCC prepared plan to increase holding tax collection up to 85% till Q3, Y3, *but CoCC, GCC and ChCC did not prepare such plan to increase holding tax collection.*

**3.2.6 Increased tax collection up to 85%,** NCC reached on 72% holding tax collection efficiency CoCC on 65%, RpCC 64% GCC 84% and ChCC reached on ---% holding tax collection efficiency till Q3, Y3, compare to 85% target by Y4.

**Activity 3.3: Re-identification of source of tax**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee	2/ CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
3.3.3 Held F&E Standing Committee meeting 4 times a year	11/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee,** the F&E Standing Committees of NCC, GCC, RpCC and ChCC use to examine re-identified new tax sources as and when necessary till Q3, Y3. *But the F&E Standing Committees of CoCC do not examine such re-identified new tax sources for unknown reasons.*

**3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation,** the F&E Standing Committees of all CCs (5) use to mention new tax sources to City Council meeting verbally when needed till Q3, Y3. *But, none of F&E Standing Committee submitted proposal of new tax source to any of their City Council meeting in Q3, Y3.*

**3.3.3 Held F&E Standing committee meeting 4 times a year,** out of targeted 11 F&E Standing Committee quarterly meetings in each CC, NCC held 7 F&E Standing Committee meetings, CoCC 6, RpCC 7, GCC 7 and ChCC held 19 F&E Standing Committee quarterly meetings till Q3, Y3. Of them NCC held 1 Standing Committee quarterly meeting, RpCC 1, GCC 1 and ChCC held 3 F&E Standing Committee quarterly meetings. *Note that CoCC could not organize any F&E Standing Committee meeting in Q3, Y3 due to absence of City Council for election.*

## Area 4: Financial Reform

### Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector(T5)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.1.1 Created independent bank account for WS and WM	1/CC & 1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for WS and WM	1/CC & 1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of WS and WM	1/CC & 1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
4.1.4 Properly adjusted water tariff and conservancy rates to recover O&M cost	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.1.1 Created independent bank account for water supply and waste management**, all CCs (5) created independent bank account for water supply and waste management before Q2, Y3. *Water supply bank account of Narayanganj and Chittagong cities are maintained by WASAs.*

**4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management**, all CCs (5) introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management before Q2, Y3. *Water supply accounting systems of Narayanganj and Chittagong cities are maintained by WASAs.*

**4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of water supply and waste management**, all CCs (5) maintains monthly income and expenditure accounts for both WS and WM, *but none of the CC maintains loss and profit account in real term.*

**4.1.4 Properly adjusted water tariff and conservancy rates to recover O&M cost**, all CCs (5) increased water tariff and conservancy rates over the years, *but didn't recover O&M cost.*

### Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T6)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to CC Act 2009	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee**, reported that F&E Standing Committees at CC levels are used to examine diversification of business operated by CCs annually, *but no documentary evidence found.*

**4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to CC Act 2009**, *none of the F&E Standing Committee prepared new business activity proposals according to CC Act 2009, but the proposals are approached to CC council meeting by F&E Standing Committee through file note for decision and onward action.*



### Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.3.1 Installed the integrated software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database, reserve fund for rehabilitation and budget	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.3.1 Installed the integrated financial management software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database, integrated financial management software (IFMS) is not ready for installation till Q3, Y3.**

**4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software, training on operation of IFMS software remains pending, since the said software is not ready for installation in any of the CC (5) till Q3, Y3.**

### Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3
4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the flowing month of each FY	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within the following three months of each FY	2/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Corporation meeting and PCO	2/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the following month of each FY, accounts department of all CCs (5) prepared financial statements till FY 2015-'16 and handed over to internal audit committee within a month of closer the fiscal year.**

**4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board, all CCs (5) used to disclose financial statement in their office decorum till FY 2015-16, not publicly.**

**4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within three months of each FY, NCC and RpCC conducted internal audit in FY 2015-16 within three months of closer of the fiscal year and ChCC internal audit is under way. CoCC & GCC didn't conduct internal audit since FY 2014-15.**

**4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Council meeting and PCO, NCC and RpCC submitted internal audit report along with summery findings to City Council meetings up to FY 2015-16. None of the CC (5) submitted internal audit report to PCO till Q3, Y3.**

### Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection	3/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.5.2 Monitored monthly progress implementation of updated non-tax revenue collection plan	33/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary	33/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue <sup>25</sup> in the monthly meeting of CC	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC updated their annual non-tax revenue collection plan in accordance with the inflation rates and model tax schedule for last 3 years. *CoCC could not produce such non-tax revenue collection schedule.*

**4.5.2 Monitored monthly progress implementation of updated non-tax revenue collection plan**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC monitored implementation progress of annual non-tax revenue plan every month till Q3, Y3. *CoCC could not monitor implementation progress of annual non-tax revenue plan, because do not have such plan.*

**4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary**, the CEO/Secretary of NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC reviewed non-tax revenue collection status every month till Q3, Y3, *but CoCC does not review non-tax revenue collection status every month.*

**4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue in City Council monthly meeting**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC reviewed progress of non-tax revenue collection status in their City Council meetings as was necessary till Q3, Y3, *but CoCC does not review progress of non-tax revenue collection status in their City Council meeting.*

#### Activity 4.6: All due debts to GOB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO	11/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others**, all CCs (5) reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others before Q2, Y3.

**4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment**, NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC kept budget provision for full repayment of due debts to GOB and other departments in FY 2016-17. *RpCC does not keep budget provision for full repayment of due debts to GOB and other departments.*

**4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO**, out of 11 targeted quarterly repayment statements on all due debt and send to PCO, NCC prepared and sent 3 repayment statements to PCO, RpCC 1; and GCC prepared and sent 4 repayment statements to PCO, among the CCs only GCC sent re-payment statement to PCO during Q3, Y3 on 11.4.2017, *but CoCC and ChCC did not prepare and send any repayment statements to PCO till Q3, Y3.*

<sup>25</sup> Other non-tax revenues are lease, fees for markets; concession fees for bus/truck terminal, water tariff etc.

**Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills	33/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	No
4.7.3 Provisioned in annual budget for electricity and telephone bill payment	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly	33/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting	33/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills**, reported that all CCs (5) receipt electricity and telephone bills regularly up-to Q3, Y3.

**4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills**, *ChCC could not settle dispute over street light electricity bills since 2005.*

**4.7.3 Provisioned in budget for electricity and telephone bill payment**, all CCs (5) kept budget provision in FY 2016-17 for payment of electricity and telephone bills.

**4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly**, all CCs (5) paid electricity and telephone bills regularly till Q3, Y3.

**4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting**, the CEO/Secretary of all CCs (5) reviewed progress of monthly bill payment status in City Council monthly meetings, whenever necessary till Q3, Y3.

**Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.8.2 Obtained comments/suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs	3/ CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	NA
4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in City Council meeting	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year**, all CCs (5) prepared draft budget proposals till FY 2016-17.

**4.8.2 Obtained comments/suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs**, all CCs (5) had pre-budget discussion session in CSCC meetings to obtain comments and suggestions on draft budget till FY 2016-17.

**4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in CC meeting**, all CCs (5) finalized and approved annual budget for FY 2016-17 in Q1, Y3.

## Area 5: Citizen's Awareness and Participation

### Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T7)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.1.1 Established CSCC <sup>26</sup> in accordance with composition and ToR	1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and prioritization	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC	Communities /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No
5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting	11/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.8 Discussion on problems & suggestions that identified in the Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) and find out the ways and means to mitigate the problems	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.9 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.10 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
5.1.11 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/ status of implementation	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**5.1.1 Established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR**, all CCs (5) established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR before Q2, Y3. Note that NCC re-established CSCC after sitting new elected City Council and introduced 2<sup>nd</sup> phase ToR in Q3, Y3. *CoCC yet to re-establish CSCC after sitting new elected City Council.*

**5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines**, all CSCCs (5) used to provide necessary assistance, supervision, guidance and progress monitoring support in implementing Infrastructure Development Plan (IDP), *but CSCCs at NCC and CoCC could not perform such responsibilities in Q3, Y3, due to City Council election.*

**5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and prioritization**, *none of the Sector-wide Working Group facilitated need identification and prioritization of physical work by their own till Q3, Y3.*

**5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC**, Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) of GCC obtained approval of 10 CAPs from City Council in Q2, Y3. *Rest CSCCs (4) did not obtain approval of CAP till Q3, Y3.*

**5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting**, out of targeted 11 CSCC quarterly general meeting each, CSCC of NCC held 6 quarterly general meetings, CoCC 5, RpCC 7, GCC 7 and CSCC of ChCC held 8 quarterly general meetings till Q3, Y3. Among quarterly general meetings CSCC of NCC held 2 meetings, CSCC of RpCC held 1 meeting, CSCC of GCC held 1 meeting and CSCC of ChCC held 2 quarterly general meeting in Q3, Y3. *Note that CSCC at CoCC could not organize quarterly general meeting in Q3, Y3 due to City Council for election.*

<sup>26</sup> Comprises of Mayor, CEO, CC officials who are in-charge of the topic of the specific CSCC meeting, representative of relevant Standing Committees, professional groups, civil societies/NGOs, private sectors (agriculture, processing and commercial industries), women, urban poor/CBO representatives, and additional member(s) or guest by Mayor's appointment.

**5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue, *none of the CSCC (5) identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problems till Q3, Y3.***

**5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income, all CSCCs (5) took decisions to identify missing holdings, tax re-assessment, tax rebate, organize tax fair, raise citizen awareness, increase tax collectors, skill development training for tax section staff, introduce computer based tax accounting system etc. for increasing revenue income.**

**5.1.8 Discussion on problems & suggestions that identified in the Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) and find out the ways and means to mitigate the problems, *none of the CSCC (5) discussed and found solutions on problems & suggestions that are identified in WLCCs till Q3, Y3.***

**5.1.9 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform, *none of the CSCC (5) prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform till Q3, Y3.***

**5.1.10 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year, CSCCs at RpCC and GCC provided necessary recommendations on CC proposed annual budget for FY 2017-18 during Q3, Y3. *CSCCs at NCC, CoCC and ChCC did not provide recommendations on CC proposed annual budget for FY 2017-18 till Q3, Y3.***

**5.1.11 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/status of implementation, all CSCCs (5) meetings decisions & actions are recorded and followed-up action/status of implementation of the decisions in the subsequent meetings till Q3, Y3.**

**Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T8)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward	1/Ward	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting	6/ Ward	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems)	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors)	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges of the Ward	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, street light etc.	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.7 Arranged quarterly open discussion meeting on overall activities (inviting 150 citizens)	11/ Ward	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward, all WLCCs are established in each ward before Q2, Y3. NCC re-established WLCC after sitting new elected City Council during Q3, Y3 and *CoCC needs to re-establish after sitting recent elected City Council.***

**5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting, WLCC meetings held at NCC 109 out of targeted 162; CoCC held 108 out of 162; RpCC held 198 out of 198; GCC held 211 out of 342; and at ChCC held 200 out of 246 targeted WLCC meetings till Q3, Y3. *Note that targets are calculated based on 2 meetings/ward/year.***

**5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems), WLCC of Ward-8 under ChCC reviewed civil works progress in their meeting on 28.2.2017. *Generally, WLCC's do not review civil works progress.***

**5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors), CSCC meeting attendance sheets indicate that Ward Councilors of NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC are attended in CSCC meetings during Q3, Y3, *but progress and problems of civil works of respective ward are not specifically discussed and recorded in meeting minutes.***

**5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges of the Ward,** WLCCs conduct casual awareness raising activity at ward level for raising payment of tax and user charges. *No such awareness activities took place in any Ward under 5 targeted CCs during Q3, Y3.*

**5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, and Street Light etc.** WLCCs are partly involved in implementation and management of WASH, SW and Street Light, *not as per project guideline till Q3, Y3. WASH, SW and street light acuties of Comilla CC are managed by officials,*

**5.2.7 Arranged quarterly open discussion meeting on overall activities (inviting 150 citizens),** *none of the WLCC in any CC arranged open discussion meeting inviting 150 citizens on overall activities of the ward, including budget allocation from CC and peoples demand till Q3, Y3.*

**Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.3.1 Conducted workshop <sup>27</sup> on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.2 Selected target wards for waste collection pilot activity	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.3.3 provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities	1 Cr. /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R	1 Cr./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.6 Review 3R activities by CG	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.7 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards	As req.	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes

*N/A= Not Applicable, Cr. = Course*

**Analysis:**

**5.3.1 Conducted workshop on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline,** *none of the CC (5) conducted workshop on "Concept and Implementation of CG Activity" for local leaders/elites, professionals, councilors, relevant CC officials till Q3, Y3.*

**5.3.2 Selected target wards for waste collection pilot activity,** NCC selected Ward-15, CoCC Ward-15, RpCC Ward-24, GCC Ward-43 and ChCC selected Ward-15 for waste collection pilot activities during Q3, Y3.

**5.3.3 Provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities,** *none of the CC (5) provided training to CG members on "Management & Implementation of Pilot Activities", till Q3, Y3.*

**5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues,** *none of the CC (5) reviewed waste collection activities and other social issues of pilot wards till Q3, Y3.*

**5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R,** *none of the CC (5) conducted training on "3R" for CG/CBO members till Q3, Y3.*

**5.3.6 Review 3R activities by CG,** *none of the Community groups/organizations reviewed 3R activities in any CCs till Q3, Y3.*

**5.3.7 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards,** NCC, CoCC, and ChCC form/select CGs/CBOs in selected pilot wards to perform waste collection activities during Q3, Y3. *RpCC & GCC did not form/select CGs/CBOs in selected pilot ward.*

<sup>27</sup> participants are (at least 30-35 persons) local leaders, local elites/different professionals, male and female ward councilors, relevant officers of CC and Mayor also may be invited in the workshop.

#### Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.4.1 Prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP)	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CCCC	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work for the Women Development Standing Committee	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation	3/CC	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual report	9/CC 2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**5.4.1 Prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP),** RpCC and GCC each somehow produced (not as per PCO guideline) Gender Action Plan during Q3, Y3, *but none of the Women Development Standing Committee (5) prepared Gender Action Plan.*

**5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CCCC,** RpCC and GCC produced Gender Action Plans are endorsed by CCCC during Q3, Y3, *but Women Development Standing Committee of NCC, CoCC and ChCC did not produce and present Gender Action Plan to CCCC for endorsement.*

**5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting,** *none of the Women Development Standing Committee (5) presented Gender Action Plan to City Council meeting for approval till Q3, Y3.*

**5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committee,** all CCs (5) assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committee before Q2, Y3.

**5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation,** CoCC allocated budget for GAP implementation in FY 2016-17, *no other CCs (NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC) did not allocate budget for GAP implementation till Q3, Y3.*

**5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual reports,** *none of the Women Development Standing Committee prepared quarterly and annual progress report on GAP implementation till Q3, Y3.*

#### Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.5.1 Established steering committee as per composition <sup>28</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.4 Task Team (Physical Work)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.5 Officials (Slum Development officer) are assigned for facilitating poverty reduction standing committee's activities	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.6 Prepared PRAP by poverty reduction standing committee with budget	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No

<sup>28</sup> Comprises of Mayor, Chairperson of Standing Committee for Poverty Reduction and Slum Development, male and female ward councilors, CEO, Chief Engineer, Health Officer, Accounts Officer, Education Officer/ Officer in Charge, Slum Development Officer/ Officer in Charge, Conservancy Officer, and Secretary.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.5.7 Held workshop <sup>29</sup> on PRAP guideline	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.8 PRAP revised and endorsed by CCCC	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No
5.5.9 PRAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.10 Selected and approved slum	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.11 Formed primary female user group	150/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.12 Established mother and child care services	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.13 Established satellite school service	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.14 Established saving, credit and IGAs	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
5.5.15 Provided training on IGAs	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.16 Provided small infrastructure development services	As feas. /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.17 Prepared annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable, Feas. = Feasible

### Analysis:

**5.5.1 Established Steering Committee as per composition**, all CCs (5) established Steering Committees to guide PRAP implementation before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit)**, all CCs (5) established task team (micro credit) to guide micro credit implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health)**, all CCs (5) established task team (Education & Health) to guide Education & Health implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.4 Task Team (physical work)**, all CCs (5) established task team (physical work) to guide physical work implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.5 Officials (Slum Development officer) are assigned for facilitating standing committee's activities**, all CCs (5) assigned officials (Slum Development officer) to facilitate Poverty Reduction Standing Committee activities before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.6 Prepared PRAP by Poverty Reduction Slum Development Standing Committee with Budget**, Poverty Reduction and Slum Development Standing Committee of GCC prepared PRAP (not as per PCO guideline) with budget provision before Q2, Y3, *but no other Poverty Reduction and Slum Development Standing Committee (4) at CC level prepared PRAP till Q3, Y3.*

**5.5.7 Held workshop on PRAP guideline**, all CCs (5) organized and facilitated workshop on "PRAP guideline" inviting only concerned CC officials before Q2, Y3, *but officials of other agencies involved in similar activities and LGED were not invited in the workshop.*

**5.5.8 PRAP revised and endorsed by CCCC**, the Poverty Reduction and Slum Development Standing Committee of GCC revised and approached revised PRAP to CCCC for endorsement before Q2, Y3, *but no other Poverty Reduction and Slum Development Standing Committee (4) at CC level approached revised PRAP to CCCC for endorsement till Q3, Y3.*

**5.5.9 PRAP approved by CC meeting**, *none of the City Corporation council meeting approved any PRAP, because those were not presented by Poverty Reduction Standing Committee till Q3, Y3,*

**5.5.10 Selected and approved slum**, all City Councils (5) approved selected slums for PRAP implementation, before Q2, Y3.

<sup>29</sup> Workshop participants are CC officials and agencies involved in the poverty reduction activities like Social Welfare Cooperative, NGOs, Ansar/VDP, LGED etc.



**5.5.11 Formed primary female user group**, each CC formed required number of primary female user groups in approved slum, before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.12 Established mother and child care services**, each CC introduced required number of primary health education/care services, including mother and child care in approved slums before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.13 Established satellite school service**, each CC started pre-primary education services in approved slims before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.14 Established saving, credit and IGAs**, each primary female user groups started weekly saving program before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.15 Provided training on IGAs**, *none of the CC provided need based IGA training to beneficiaries till Q3, Y3.*

**5.5.16 Provided small infrastructure development services**, *none of the CC provided infrastructure development services in the approved slums or slum areas till. Q3, Y3.*

**5.5.17 Prepared annual report**, *none of the Poverty Reduction Standing Committee prepared annual progress reports.*

**Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually	1/CC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in charge for preparation/revision of the Citizen Charter before Q2, Y3.

**5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC**, all CSCCs (5) discussed and approved revised Citizen Charter in their meeting presented by working group/officer in charge before Q2, Y3.

**5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually**, *none of the approved Citizen Charter got maturity of one year for revision till Q3, Y3.*

**5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter**, NCC, RpCC and ChCC disclosed citizen charter through display, booklet, local newspaper and website, *but CoCC & GCC Citizen Charters are not found available in public place during monitoring of Q3, Y3.*

**Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3
5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team <sup>30</sup> to organize citizen report card survey	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.2 Task team/WG to prepared citizen report card	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.3 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire surveys	2/CC	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
5.7.4 Discussed draft CRC report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>30</sup> Comprises of the 3 members assigned by Mayor

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3
and recommendation taken from CSCC											
5.7.5 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team to organize citizen report card survey**, all CCs (5) formed 3 members task team and assigned to organize citizen report card survey before Q2, Y3, *but none of task team is actively involved in citizen report card survey.*

**5.7.2 Task team/WG to prepared citizen report card**, *none of Task Team/Working Group prepared Citizen Report Card, GICD themself prepared and sent to City Corporation to carry out survey during Q2, Y3.*

**5.7.3 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire survey**, reported that each CC (5) carried out citizen report card survey with 100 holdings *instead of 500 during Q3, Y3.*

**5.7.4 Discussed draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC**, *draft CRC reports were not ready for discussion and recommendation from CSCC till Q3, Y3.*

**5.7.5 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2**, *CRC survey results were not at all compiled and disclosed publicly.*

#### Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.8.4 Invited potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting if require	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge to set the GRC before Q2, Y3.

**5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office**, all CCs (5) established Grievance Redress Cell at CC offices before Q2, Y3.

**5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs**, all CCs (5) held need based GRC meetings, *not monthly or more as per guideline, since there are no compensation provision in the project.*

**5.8.4 Invited potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting, if require**, *no evidence of inviting potentials complaints observed in any City Corporation during till Q3, Y3.*

**5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances**, *no evidence of maintaining register, meeting notice, meeting minute's etc. for keeping records of all grievances observed till Q3, Y3.*

**5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action, *no documentary evidence found of presenting grievance redress agenda in CC meeting for taking appropriate action till Q3, Y3.***

## Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement

### Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.	1/CC	No	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	Yes	Yes	N/A
6.1.2 Available detailed area plan	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge <sup>31</sup> for each plan	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.1.5 Established committee for each plan <sup>32</sup>	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.** CoCC and RpCC have prepared their Master Plan with the assistance of Local Government Engineering Department (LGED) and submitted to Local Government Division (LGD) for approval long ago. ChCC Master Plan prepared by Chittagong Development Authority (CDA).

Dhaka Metropolitan Development Plan (DMDP) has prepared for part of NCC and GCC in 1997 by Rajdhani Unnayan Kartipakkha (RAJUK). And Action Area Plans for remaining part of NCC and GCC are prepared by LGED and submitted to Local Government Division (LGD) in January 2017 for approval till Q3, Y3.

**6.1.2 Available detailed area plan, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC** have their Detail Area Plans (DAPs), among them DAPs for NCC and GCC are finalized for areas within RAJUK in June 2010 for 5 years and those are now under revision. *CoCC does not have detail area plan.*

**6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities, *none of the CC prepared their Action Plan for infrastructure and public facilities based on Master Plan till Q3, Y3.***

**6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge for each plan, *none of the CC assigned officer in charge for each (drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.) infrastructure and public facilities plan till Q3, Y3.***

**6.1.5 Established committee for each plan, *none of the CC established committee for each (drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.) infrastructure and public facilities plan till Q3, Y3.***

### Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T9)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>31</sup> Officer in charge of CSCC, CDCC, and RAJUK/ CDC only in NCC, GCC & ChCC

<sup>32</sup> Plans are drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission**, all CCs (5) assigned one officer in-charge each for building permission before Q2, Y3.

**6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure**, all CCs (5) defined signatory for application procedure before Q2, Y3.

**6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings**, *none of the CC together with WLCCs and CSCCs identified illegal buildings in their territory till Q3, Y3.*

**6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings**, *none of the CC taken any action for illegal buildings till Q3, Y3.*

#### Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.3.1 Published IDP in website or print copy for citizen access	1/CC/year	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
6.3.2 Shared revise IDP in CDCC by 2nd quarter each year	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.3.3 Approved revise IDP by CC Parishad	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote IDP	As req.										

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.3.1 Published IDP in website or print copy for citizen access**, all CCs (5) published IDP both in website and print copy for citizen access till Q2, Y3.

**6.3.2 Shared revise IDP in CDCC by 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter each year**, all CDCCs (5) revised their IDP before Q3, Y3.

**6.3.3 Approved revise CCIDP by CC Parishad**, all CCs Parishad (5) approved revised CCIDP before Q3, Y3.

**6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote IDP**, *approached for practical promotion of IDP to any financial supporters issue needs further check in next quarter.*

#### Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan	0	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO**, all CCs (5) prepared annual O&M action plan with budget provision for CGP funded 1<sup>st</sup> batch sub-projects in accordance with PCO set framework and finally obtained approval from PCO before Q2, Y3.

**6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan**, reported that all CCs (5) will implement PCO approved annual O&M action plan, soon after contractor's maintenance period is over/expire.

**Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T10)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge of environmental conservation	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge of environmental conservation**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge of environmental conservation before Q2, Y3.

**6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development**, all CCs (5) obtained required environmental clearance/concurrence from Department of Environment (DoE) and JICA for all 55 sub-projects under batch-1 and complied act and rules in its infrastructure development.

Also, environmental clearance/concurrence of 71 sub-projects under batch-2 has obtained from DoE and JICA in Q3, y3. *DoE/JICA environmental clearance/concurrence for remaining 6 sub-projects is under way.*

**6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act**, *none of the CC (5) identified environmentally vulnerable areas against environment conservation act till Q3, Y3.*

Rather NCC identified 42 vulnerable living/commercial/office buildings and RpCC identified such 28 building. *Rest CCs (3) did not identified vulnerable buildings till Q3, Y3.*

**6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act**, NCC issued notice to 42 individual owners to stop use of those vulnerable buildings, similar notice published in local news paper and requested concerned utility service providers to stop services in those identified living/commercial buildings.

RpCC issued notice to 28 individual owners to stop use of those vulnerable buildings, putted red mark on those identified buildings and requested utility service providers to stop services on those buildings in Q3, Y3. *CoCC, GCC and ChCC did not take any action, because such buildings are not identified till Q3, Y3.*

**Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge of sanitation	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.4 Build public toilets	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for households' waste water	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge of sanitation**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in charge of sanitation before Q2, Y3.

**6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition**, *none of the CC (5) carried out/ updated situation analysis on overall sanitation condition till Q3, Y3.*

*Note that the national sanitation situation analysis carried out 2003 and/or carried out by any other project/agency by the time could be compiled and updated to make it compatible with present situation.*

**6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets**, *none of the CC (5) analyzed present demand and area for public and household toilets till Q3, Y3. All CCs (5) prepared need lists of public toilets, which are not at all demand analysis.*

**6.6.4 Build public toilets**, *none of the CC built public toilets from CGP fund till Q3, Y3. Reported that RpCC has constructed 7 public toilets from their own fund in Q3, Y3*

**6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets**, all CCs (5) leased out existing public toilets given the responsibility of regular operation, maintenance and small repair to lease holders till Q3, Y3.

**6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation**, *none of the CC (5) facilitated household toilet installation from CGP support till Q3, Y3.*

**6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for households' waste water**, *none of the CC (5) increased household's waste water connection with CGP constructed drainage till Q3, Y3.*

#### Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management (T11)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for SWM, phase-1	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.7.2 Established solid waste management committee <sup>33</sup> (SWMC), phase-1	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.3 Prepared SWM plan, phase-1	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.4 Trained staff on SWM, phase-1	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

<sup>33</sup> Comprises of (7 to 9 members) representatives from each community group (CG), male & female ward councilors and one CC official.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for solid waste management, phase-1**, all CCs (5) assigned officers in-charge for Solid Waste Management before Q2, Y3.

**6.7.2 Established solid waste management committee (SWMC), phase-1**, all CCs (5) established Standing Committee for Solid Waste Management before Q2, Y3. *But none of the CC established 7-9 members Solid Waste Management Committee with one representative from each community group (CG), male & female ward councilors and one CC official till Q3, Y3.*

**6.7.3 Prepared solid waste management plan, phase-1**, *none of the CC (5) prepared solid waste management plan as per PCO guideline till Q3, Y3.*

**6.7.4 Trained staff for solid waste management, phase-1**, *none of the CC (5) trained staff on solid waste management and community mobilization facilitator to promote leadership, even did not organize any public awareness and social mobilization activities as per PCO guideline till Q3, Y3.*

**6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1**, *no agreement signed between CG and WLCC for SWM at any CC till Q3, Y3.*

**6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) established primary waste collection system in as their tradition before Q2, Y3, *not as per PCO guideline.*

**6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station as their tradition before Q2, Y3, *not as per PCO guideline.*

**6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) coordinates to clean solid waste from road and drainage in phase-1, as their tradition, *not as per PCO guideline.*

**6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2**, reported that all CCs (5) collects solid waste in wider area and disposes it into a specific dumping site since phase-2 as their tradition. *None of the CC have designated dumping site as per PCO guideline.*

**6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting**, *none of CC (5) initiated 3R piloting till Q3, Y3.*

## Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement

### Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer**, all CCs (5) assigned Law Officer before Q2, Y3. The Privet Secretary of Mayor at RpCC has given additional responsibility as Law Officer on 5.1.2017.

**7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign**, all Law Officers prepared annual plans and budget for specific awareness campaign issue for Y2 and Y3.

**7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC**, all CCs (5) approved plans and budget presented by respective Law Officer on specific awareness campaign issue, incorporating necessary comment/revision suggested by Standing Committee for Law and Discipline, where ever required for Y2 and Y3.

**7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity**, all Law Officers guided implementation of one awareness campaign activity each year on specific rules of law issue for Y2 and Y3.

**7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO**, all Law Officers prepared 1<sup>st</sup> awareness campaign report of Y2, furthermore, NCC, CoCC and ChCC prepared 2<sup>nd</sup> awareness campaign report of Y3 (took place in Q3), among them Law Officer of NCC and ChCC submitted reports to Mayor and CEO.

**Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established (T12)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) <sup>34</sup>	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.2.3 Conducted workshop <sup>35</sup> on LEU guideline and activity	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.5 Conducted training <sup>36</sup> on law enforcement	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.2.7 Produced report on law enforcement	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.8 Established trial court	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU)**, all CCs (5) established LEU before Q2, Y3. *NCC and CoCC need to re-establish LEU after recent City Council election.*

**7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed**, all Mayors (5) issued and distributed circular in regards to establishment of LEU before Q2, Y3. *Mayor at NCC and CoCC need to re-issue circular after re-establishment of LEU.*

**7.2.3 Conducted workshop on LEU guideline and activity**, *none of the CC (5) conducted workshop on LEU guideline till Q3, Y3.*

**7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement**, *none of the LEU (5) prepared annual plans and budget for operating Law Enforcement Unit till Q3, Y3.*

<sup>34</sup> LEU comprises of member of the Standing Committee on Law and Discipline, Magistrate (nominated by the Deputy Commissioner if the magistrate is not appointed in the CC), Police Officer (nominated by the Superintendent of Police preferably ASP), and Law Officer.

<sup>35</sup> Pparticipants of the workshop/seminar are elected representatives, members of the Standing Committees, Grievance Redress cell, Community Based Organization, elites of the city, concerned private organizations and journalists.

<sup>36</sup> The training needs to be given subject wise by the senior officials of the CC and the resource persons to LEU members.



**7.2.5 Conducted training on law enforcement**, *none of the LEU (5) provided training to concern officials and members of Standing Committee for Law and Discipline on Law Enforcement till Q3, Y3.*

**7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity**, all CCs (5) implemented law enforcement activities such as commissioned mobile court, evicted illegal occupants from footpaths, action against food adulteration, evicted illegal occupants from CC owned land etc. as and when required till Q3, Y3.

**7.2.6 Produced report on law enforcement**, *none of the LEU (5) produced report on law enforcement activities till Q3, Y3.*

**7.2.7 Established trial court**, all CCs (5) establishes trial court and functions when required.

**Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented (T13)**

Sub-activity/ Task	Target till Q-3, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-3, Y-3
7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement**, *none of the CC (5) officials and Standing Committee for Law and Discipline members participated in training on Law Enforcement till Q3, Y3.*

**7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law**, departments of City Corporation raised law related issues to the Law Officers to examine and propose possible action, whenever necessary till Q3, Y3.

**7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities**, *none of Law Officer examined plans of law enforcement activities, since plans are not prepared by LEU till Q3, Y3.*

**4.2 Component-2: Infrastructure Development**

**a) Physical and Financial progress by sub-projects and batches**

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
NCCB1-01	93	85
NCCB1-02	100	88
NCCB1-03	100	88

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 3 sub-projects under batch-1, two** (package 2 & 3) completed 100% physical work followed by 88% payment progress and remaining **one sub-project** (Package 1) completed 93% physical work followed by 85% financial payment progress till Q3, Y3.

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
NCCB2-04	5	0
NCCB2-05	0.5	0
NCCB2-06	1.25	0

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 12 sub-projects under batch-2, three** (package 4, 5 & 6) just started physical works and followed by 5, 0.5 & 1.25% physical progress till Q3, Y3.

**Comilla City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
CoCCB1-01	100	80
CoCCB1-02	100	78
CoCCB1-03	100	82
CoCCB1-04	100	76
CoCCB1-05	100	79
CoCCB1-06	100	77
CoCCB1-07	100	84
<b>CoCCB1-08</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>	
CoCCB1-09	100	100

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 8 sub-projects under batch-1**, all (package 1-7 & 9) completed 100% physical works followed by final payment progress of **one** (Package 9), and for rest **seven** sub-project (package 1-7) final payments are under preparation till Q3, Y3.

**Comilla City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

**Analysis:**

**All 9 sub-projects of batch-2** are under preparation till Q3, Y3

**Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
RpCCB1-01	100	100
RpCCB1-02	75	51
RpCCB1-03	100	98
RpCCB1-04	58	54
RpCCB1-05	100	94
RpCCB1-06	75	63
RpCCB1-07	95	87
RpCCB1-08	95	72
RpCCB1-09	98	86
RpCCB1-10	95	85
RpCCB1-11	83	54
RpCCB1-12	87	61
RpCCB1-13	98	68
RpCCB1-14	90	80
RpCCB1-15	85	67
RpCCB1-16	80	72
RpCCB1-17	100	85
RpCCB1-18	95	90

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 18 sub-projects under batch-1**, **four** (package 1, 3, 5 & 17) completed 100% physical works followed by 100, 98, 94 & 85% payment progress; **seven** (package 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 14 & 18) completed between 90-98% physical works followed by 87, 72, 86, 85, 68, 80 & 90% payment progress; **four** (package 11, 12, 15, & 16) completed 83, 87, 85 & 80% physical works followed by 54, 61, 67 & 72% payment progress; **two** (package 2 & 6) completed 75% physical works followed by 51 & 63% payment progress; and **one** sub-project (package 4) completed 58% physical works followed by 54% payment progress till Q3, Y3.

## Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects

### Analysis:

**Out of total 25 sub-projects under batch -2, six** (Package 3, 5, 7, 8, 9 &23) tenders are approved; **seven** (package 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, & 20) NOAs are issued; and **three** sub-project's (package 6, 10 &21) tender evaluations are under process till Q3, Y3.

## Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
GCCB1-01	41	30
GCCB1-02	76	55
GCCB1-03	37	20
GCCB1-04	57	22
GCCB1-05	45	30
GCCB1-06	97	80
GCCB1-07	80	69
GCCB1-08	65	43
GCCB1-09	91	84

### Analysis:

**Out of total 9 sub-projects under batch-1, two** (package 6 & 9) completed 97 & 91% physical works followed by 80 & 84% payment progress, **one** (package 7) completed 80% physical works followed by 69% payment progress, **one** (package 2) completed 76% physical works followed by 55% payment progress, **one** (package 8) completed 65% physical works followed by 43% payment progress, **one** (package 4) completed 57% physical works followed by 22% payment progress, **two** (package 1 & 5) completed 41 & 45% physical works followed by 30% payment progress and **one** sub-project (package 3) completed 37% physical works followed by 20% payment progress till Q3, Y3.

## Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects

### Analysis:

**Out of total 14 sub-projects under batch-2, five** (package 4, 7, 9, 11, & 13) contract agreements signed till Q3, Y3.

## Chittagong City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
ChCCB1-01	100	46
ChCCB1-02	100	60
ChCCB1-03	95	83
ChCCB1-04	100	80
<b>ChCCB1-05</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>	
ChCCB1-06	70	50
ChCCB1-07	15	0
ChCCB1-08	55	49
ChCCB1-09	55	45
ChCCB1-10	65	62
ChCCB1-11	95	79
ChCCB1-12	95	85
ChCCB1-13	95	84
<b>ChCCB1-14</b>	<b>Shifted in batch-2</b>	
ChCCB1-15	60	50

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
ChCCB1-16	20	5
ChCCB1-17	80	71
ChCCB1-18	50	42

**Analysis:**

**Out of total (18-2) 16 sub-projects under batch-2, three** (package 1, 2 & 4) completed 100% physical works followed by 46, 60 & 80% payment progress, **four** (package 3, 11, 12 & 13) completed 95% physical works followed by 83, 79, 85 & 84% payment progress, **one** (package 17) completed 80% physical works followed by 71% payment progress, **one** (package 6) completed 70% physical works followed by 50% payment progress, **two** (package 10 & 14) completed 65 & 60% physical works followed by 62 and 50% payment progress, **three** (package 8, 9 & 18) completed 55, 55 & 50% physical works followed by 49, 45 & 42% payment progress, **one** (package 16) completed 20% physical works followed by 5% payment progress, and **one** sub-project (package 7) completed only 15% physical works followed by no payment progress till Q3, Y3.

**Chittagong City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

**Analysis:**

**Out of 17 sub-projects under batch-2, three** (package 10, 14, and 17) received tenders during Q3, Y3.

**b) Implementation Time Schedule by sub-projects**

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)			
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended	3 <sup>rd</sup> Extended
NCCB1-01	365	54	62	85
NCCB1-02	365	195	93	
NCCB1-03	365	165	123	

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 3 sub-projects under batch-1, package-1** required time extension thrice for 54, 62, & 85 days; **package-2** required twice for 195 & 93 days; and **package-3** required time extension twice for 165 & 123 days against scheduled time of 365 days for each till Q3, Y3.

**Comilla City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)	
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended
CoCCB1-01	365	
CoCCB1-02	365	
CoCCB1-03	365	
CoCCB1-04	365	
CoCCB1-05	365	75
CoCCB1-06	365	75
CoCCB1-07	365	
<b>CoCCB1-08</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>	
CoCCB1-09	365	

**Analysis:**

**Out of total (9-1) 8 sub-projects under batch-1, package 5 & 6** required time extension once for 75 days each; and rest **packages 1, 2, 3, 4, 7 & 9** did not require time extension till Q3, Y3.

**Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
RpCCB1-01	365		
RpCCB1-02	365		
RpCCB1-03	365		
RpCCB1-04	365		

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
RpCCB1-05	365		
RpCCB1-06	365	63	107
RpCCB1-07	365		
RpCCB1-08	365		
RpCCB1-09	365		
RpCCB1-10	365		
RpCCB1-11	365	75	162
RpCCB1-12	365		
RpCCB1-13	365		
RpCCB1-14	365		
RpCCB1-15	365		
RpCCB1-16	365		
RpCCB1-17	365		
RpCCB1-18	365		

**Analysis:**

**Out of total 18 sub-projects under batch-1**, package 6 & 11 required time extension twice for first extension 63 & 107 days and for second extension 75 & 162 days respectively; **packages 1, 3, 4, 5, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14, 17 & 18** did not require time extension and *package 2, 7, 13, 15 & 16 require recast decision and subsequent time extension till Q3, Y3*

**Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
GCCB1-01	365	74	76
GCCB1-02	365	74	72
GCCB1-03	365	73	
GCCB1-04	365	73	
GCCB1-05	365	73	
GCCB1-06	365	73	
GCCB1-07	365	74	153
GCCB1-08	365	73	
GCCB1-09	365	72	147

**Analysis:**

**Out of 9 sub-projects under batch-1**, package 3, 4, 5, 6, & 8 required time extension once for 73 days each; and **package 1, 2, 7 & 9** required time extension twice for first extension 74 & 76; 74 & 72; 74 days & for second extension 153 and 72 & 147 days respectively till Q3, Y3.

**Chittagong City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
ChCCB1-01	365	76	0
ChCCB1-02	365	75	0
ChCCB1-03	365	71	0
ChCCB1-04	365	0	0
<b>ChCCB1-05</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>		
ChCCB1-06	365	77	0
ChCCB1-07	365	303	0
ChCCB1-08	365	304	0
ChCCB1-09	365	237	0

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
ChCCB1-10	365	74	0
ChCCB1-11	365	86	0
ChCCB1-12	365	86	0
ChCCB1-13	365	86	0
<b>ChCCB1-14</b>	<b>Shifted in batch-2</b>		
ChCCB1-15	365	0	0
ChCCB1-16	365	236	0
ChCCB1-17	365	66	0
ChCCB1-18	365	139	0

**Analysis:**

**Out of (18-2) sub-projects, package 1-3** required time extension for 76, 75 & 71 days, **package 6-13** required 77, 303, 304, 237, 74, 86, 86, 86 days; and **package 16-18** required 236, 66 & 139 days time extension respectively, while **package 4 & 15** have not required time extension till Q3, Y3.

**5. Challenges of the program**

- Promote **role clarity** among the stakeholders and individuals
- Introduce and continue **all ICGIAP activities** by project year 4
- Reassure **facilitation and supervision** guidelines
- Translate ICGIAP into **implementation** plan
- Establish **linkage between facilitation, supervision and implementation** to enhance quality
- Assure meaningful **facilitation and supervision**
- Ensure **attention to process** as described in guidelines
- Activate **regular progress** monitoring and reporting
- Enhance **coordination** between service providing agencies (GO, NGO, Private etc.) under CC territory
- Create **enabling environment** for feedback/learning sharing, and
- Restrict frequent **turnover of key personnel** at CC level.